Validation of Religious Tolerance Scale for High School Students: Confirmatory Factor Analysis Study

Edris Zamroni [1*], Indah Lestari [2], Gudnanto [3], Maulana Wihartanty [4]

[1] Universitas Muria Kudus, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia
edris.zamroni@umk.ac.id

[2] Universitas Muria Kudus, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia
indah.lestari@umk.ac.id

[3] Universitas Muria Kudus, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia
gudnanto@umk.ac.id

[4] Universitas Muria Kudus, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia
mwihartanty@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to conduct a confirmatory factor analysis on students' religious tolerance scale. The study was conducted in the Kudus district by involving 418 high school students in the age range of 14-17 years old who were randomly selected through the distribution of a Google form-based questionnaire. The data collected included students from various religions, including Islam, Christianity, Catholicism, and Buddhism. In preparing concepts and items, expert validation involved five experts: Christian religious education experts, psychological scale experts, language experts, guidance and counseling service experts, and Islamic spiritual education service experts. The test results showed a KMO MSA of 0.949 and formed five factors, each with an anti-image value of each component, including peacefully 0.829, bravery 0.958, respect 0.848, awareness 0.850, and cooperation 0.837. These results indicate that this instrument is qualified to be used as a measurement scale for religious tolerance in students.

Keywords: religious tolerance, confirmatory factor analysis, validation, high school students.

1. Introduction

In the era of globalization and advances in information technology, the world is becoming increasingly connected and interconnected. In this context, communities worldwide are increasingly diverse regarding culture, religion, ethnicity, and social background (Sholeh, 2014; Sufanti et al., 2014a, 2014b). Amid these conditions, schools play an essential role as a place where the younger generation gets an education, not only in academics but also in understanding and appreciating the diversity of society. Tolerance is essential in creating an inclusive and harmonious school environment where students can learn and grow without barriers (Simon et al., 2019; Wan Husin et al., 2021). Education is not only about knowledge and skills but also about shaping character and attitudes. As a fundamental value, tolerance needs to be instilled early in education (Janmaat & Keating, 2019). As educational institutions, schools have a crucial role in teaching students about respecting differences and accepting every individual regardless of their background. Tolerance is not only about respecting religions and cultures but also involves respecting different views, opinions, and lifestyles (Alhadiq & Ramadhan, 2021; Azis et al., 2018).

Despite its importance, building tolerance in schools is not an easy task. Several challenges may be faced, such as Stereotypes and Prejudices where students may have a narrow understanding of other groups based on stereotypes and prejudices formed from the influence of the environment outside the school, incomprehension of differences resulting from a lack of knowledge about diverse cultures, religions and traditions can hinder the development of tolerance among students and intergroup conflicts where interactions between different groups often lead to conflict, especially if there is no understanding and appreciation of these differences (Kartini et al., 2019; Purwaningsih, 2015). Student tolerance in schools has an important role in shaping a young generation that can live harmoniously in an increasingly multicultural society. Building tolerance is not an easy task, but with the

right approach, schools can be an effective learning vehicle to respect and celebrate diversity. By involving all stakeholders in schools, including teachers, students, and parents, we can shape a more tolerant and inclusive future generation (Novitasari & Wardani, 2020; Sri Wahyuni & Yusuf, 2020). Tolerance is an attitude and action to accept differences and respect the rights of each individual regardless of differences in religion, ethnicity, race, gender, or social background. Tolerance is very important in students' lives at school, because schools are places where students from different backgrounds gather and interact with each other (Mokoena et al., 2021). At school, students can learn and grow together with classmates who are different in religion, ethnicity, and culture. Tolerance plays an important role in creating a harmonious and inclusive environment at school (Anas et al., 2019). In situations where students have significant differences, tolerance can help reduce conflict and promote cooperation and understanding (Basharpoor et al., 2021).

Tolerance in student life at school also means respecting individual rights. Every student has the right to have their own opinions and beliefs. Tolerance allows students to express their opinions without fear of being judged or intimidated by others (Thaufan & Sapriya, 2018). It creates space for students to learn and grow without fear or apprehension. In addition, tolerance also teaches students to appreciate differences in views and cultures. When students explore different cultures and beliefs, they can gain a broader understanding of the world and people around them (Aswidar & Saragih, 2022). This will help students become global citizens who are knowledgeable and open to diversity.

Tolerance also plays an important role in reducing discriminatory and violent behavior in schools. When students learn to accept differences and respect individual rights, they tend to be more accepting and appreciative of each other (Marium et al., 2019). This creates a safer and more comfortable environment for all students at school. However, it is important to remember that tolerance does not mean we have to agree or like everything different from us (Shen et al., 2018). Tolerance involves recognizing and respecting differences, even if we do not always agree with them. This is an important skill that should be taught to students early on, as they will encounter differences in their lives later on (Gursoy et al., 2017).

Indonesia, as a country with rich cultural, ethnic, and religious diversity, has placed religious tolerance as a fundamental principle in building a harmonious society (Kang et al., 2022). Religious tolerance is the ability to accept and respect differences in religious beliefs among individuals within one society. The importance of religious tolerance in Indonesia can be seen from several aspects involving social, political, economic, and cultural issues (Garneau & Schwadel, 2022). First, religious tolerance reflects the spirit of Indonesia's diversity enshrined in Pancasila, the state foundation that recognizes religious diversity and promotes unity. In this context, religious tolerance acts as a bridge that connects people with different religious backgrounds, thus encouraging the formation of an inclusive national identity. With religious tolerance, every individual feels recognized and respected in practicing their beliefs, so there is no room for religious discrimination or intolerance (Mao et al., 2018). Second, religious tolerance also plays a role in maintaining social stability and avoiding inter-religious conflict. Indonesia has a long history of maintaining harmony between different religious communities. Religious tolerance is an important factor in preventing horizontal conflicts that can destroy social order. In this context, religious tolerance encourages interfaith dialogue, mutual understanding, and cooperation to build sustainable peace (Sakallı et al., 2021).

Third, religious tolerance has a positive impact on economic development. Indonesia is a country with great economic potential, and religious tolerance can be an important asset to encourage investment and sustainable economic growth. When people have appreciation and respect for religious differences, business relationships can run smoothly and be mutually beneficial (Marium et al., 2019). Religious tolerance also opens opportunities for interfaith cooperation in the economic field, such as the development of a religion-based tourism industry. Fourth, religious tolerance is an important factor in maintaining Indonesia's cultural heritage (Simon et al., 2019). Indonesia has a rich cultural heritage that is closely related to religious diversity. Religious tolerance allows people to maintain their religious practices and religious traditions without fear of oppression or assimilation. In this context, religious tolerance acts as a link between different religious cultures, preserves local wisdom, and promotes cultural diversity which is an integral part of Indonesia's identity (Laborie, 2017).

Tolerance is an important principle in social life, especially in student life at school. Therefore, understanding tolerance is essential to ensure a harmonious relationship between students and their environment. One thing to remember is that tolerance does not mean we have to take a neutral position, but rather be able to maintain and appreciate differences (Maurer & Gellera, 2020). For example, when at home, everyone has something different in beliefs and ways of thinking. This must be respected and is the essence of tolerance itself. When it comes to student life at school, tolerance will be crucial in improving interactions between students of different backgrounds and ensuring a comfortable environment for all of them. A school that upholds the value of tolerance will tend to have a higher sense of unity and its students will feel safer. Therefore, students need to understand the concept of tolerance and implement it in their daily decisions and actions. This can be achieved through educational approaches in the learning process, for example by explaining the value and benefits of tolerance (Staničić & Šijaković, 2019). In addition, appropriate discipline should be applied when events occur that can disrupt the goal of creating a harmonious environment. But what when students in fact lack tolerance? Does this mean that schools are failing in their duties? No, it does not. This should be a challenge for schools and teachers to move forward in teaching social values including tolerance. Understanding tolerance that begins with understanding differences and appreciating them will make students' lives at school better, more comfortable, and more convenient. It lies in proper education and coaching of students to practice social values in their daily lives (Gellera, 2020; Justwan & Fisher, 2021; Lacoe & Steinberg, 2018).

Religious tolerance in Indonesia cannot be doubted. Religious tolerance reflects the spirit of diversity, maintains social stability, promotes economic development, and maintains cultural heritage (Ni et al., n.d.; Suciartini, 2017). To achieve these goals, governments, community institutions, and individuals must commit to building and strengthening religious tolerance. Only with strong religious tolerance can Indonesia become a harmonious and advanced country in facing the challenges of religious diversity in this global era (Kartini et al., 2019; Mokoena et al., 2021). Tolerance is a very important attitude in student life at school. It creates a harmonious, inclusive, and safe environment for students to learn and grow together. Tolerance teaches students to appreciate differences, respect individual rights, and reduce conflict and violence in schools. Therefore, it is important to promote and teach tolerance to students as part of their education (Conway et al., 2021; Garneau & Schwadel, 2022).

To get an objective picture of the condition of student tolerance in schools, it is necessary to develop an assessment that can reveal objective data about student tolerance in the form of students' thoughts, attitudes, and behavior. This scale was developed in the school context because as a wiyata mandala institution, schools must be a place to develop positive mindsets, attitudes, and behaviors that support the achievement of optimal educational goals. This article will examine the extent of validity and reliability as well as the reliability of instruments that can later be used as non-cognitive diagnostic assessment materials for guidance and counseling teachers in schools.

2. Method

Research Design

The instrument validation step is carried out utilizing Confirmatory Factor Analysis. Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA). The main purpose of CFA is to test whether the empirical data obtained follows the previously proposed factor structure (Cresswell, 2014; Sugiyono, 2017). This method is often used in psychology, sociology, economics, and other social sciences to test theories about how variables are related within a larger concept. General steps in conducting Confirmatory Factor Analysis research; First, Develop a Conceptual Model: The researcher first develops a conceptual model that describes the relationship between the variables. The conceptual model of tolerance is taken from the Wibisono et al. theory, (2020). Second, create a Statistical model: Based on the conceptual model, researchers must formulate a statistical model that maps the relationship between variables in mathematical form. The variables include peaceful, bravery, awareness, respect, and cooperation. This statistical model will describe how the variables are expected to correlate and how factors affect the variables. Third, empirical data is collected from a sample relevant to the study. This sample should reflect the population to be studied. Fourth, testing the model with empirical data is tested using the statistical model that has been created. CFA involves the use of complex statistical techniques, such as analysis of covariance, to check the extent to which the empirical data fit the proposed model. Fifth, evaluate the model where at this stage, the researcher analyzes the model test results to see the extent to which the model fits the data. Some measures often used in

CFA are chi-square, Comparative Fit Index (CFI), Tucker-Lewis Index (TLI), and Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA). CFA assists researchers in testing hypotheses about the factor structure and relationships between variables within an existing theoretical framework. It allows researchers to validate the constructs or concepts they wish to examine using empirical data and results in a deeper understanding of how variables are related in a given domain.

Population and Sample

The population of this study is high school students in Kudus Regency. The number of students in Kudus in the 2023/2024 school year was 29,299. The sample selection was carried out by random sampling method while the number was calculated using Slovin's calculation. Based on the results of the calculation, the minimum sample size is 300 students. This study involved 418 high school students spread across high schools and vocational schools in Kudus Regency. Students who became respondents consisted of various religions ranging from Islam, Christianity, Catholicism, and Buddhism. The age range of students was 14 to 17 years old, both male and female. In terms of community organizations, students who became respondents came from NU, Muhmamadiyah, LDII, and Christian religious organizations.

3. Result

The religious tolerance scale is used to find out the level of religious tolerance in students. Whether it's different religions or just different social organizations. This is important to serve as the basis for the preparation of educational policies in schools in general (Utaminingsih et al., 2017), as well as guidance and counseling services in particular (Hadiwinarto, 2014; Kartadinata, 2011; Santoso et al., 2015; Setiadi et al., 2017; Zamroni, 2022). The results of the KMO Bartlett's Test are as follows:

Table 1. Pengujian KMO and Bartlett's Test

Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy.		**0,949**
Bartlett's Test of Sphericity	Approx. Chi-Square	15241,803
	df	528
	Sig.	0,000

Based on Table.1, it is known that the KMO MSA value is 0.949>0.5 so it meets the requirements for further factor analysis. The significance value is 0.000 <0.05 which reinforces the fulfillment of the requirements to continue the next stage. After that, anti-image correlation testing is carried out in Table 2 below.

Table 2. Anti-image Matrices

		Peacefully	Bravery	Respect	Awareness	Cooperation
Anti-image Correlation	Peacefully	.829[a]				
	Bravery		.958[a]			
	Respect			.848[a]		
	Awareness				.850[a]	
	Cooperation					.837[a]

Based on Table 2, it is known that the MSA value of each component includes peacefully 0.829, bravery 0.958, respect 0.848, awareness 0.850, and cooperation 0.837, all of which are more than 0.5, which means they meet the requirements. Furthermore, factor grouping is carried out for each item through rotation component matrix analysis as presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Rotated Component Matrix[a]

	Component				
	1	2	3	4	5
A1	0,898				
A10			0,843		
A12	0,841				
A4			0,627		
A7	0,830				
A8	0,850				
B2	0,731				
B4		0,487			
B5					0,636
C1	0,833				
C12		0,883			
C3				0,712	
C4				0,551	
C5	0,864				
C6	0,770				
C6			0,874		
C7	0,852				
P1					0,569
P10	0,853				
P11		0,892			
P12	0,908				
P3			0,260		
P5	0,689				
P6	0,812				
P7				0,746	
P8	0,748				
P9	0,808				
R1	0,734				
R11	0,837				
R12	0,858				
R13	0,901				
R2	0,871				
R9	0,919				

Based on Table 3, it is known that the distribution of elements and the relationship with the components or constituent factors. Looking at the data distribution, the items can form 5 factors following the predetermined indicators.

4. Discussion

In the current era of globalization, where differences in religion and belief are increasingly visible in society, students need to have a strong understanding of religious tolerance. Religious tolerance is an attitude of mutual

respect and acceptance of religious and belief differences between individuals or groups (Hill QC, 2020; Santoso et al., 2022). In the context of education, students need to understand and test religious tolerance to build a harmonious and inclusive society. First of all, understanding and testing religious tolerance helps students develop mutual respect and appreciation for differences in the context of religion and belief. Through thorough learning about existing religions, students can understand the values and beliefs underlying each religion. It also helps them see the similarities in moral values found in various religions (Nurul et al., n.d.; Tan, 2007). Thus, students will be able to respect different religions and beliefs and avoid discriminatory or intolerant attitudes toward others.

Religious tolerance is one of the important aspects of the life of the nation and state. In a country with religious diversity like Indonesia, understanding and practicing religious tolerance is very important to build interfaith harmony (Novis-Deutsch, 2020; Zakiyah, 2022). Therefore, it is important to test and understand students' level of religious tolerance to build a sustainable and tolerant generation. This article will discuss the importance of testing and understanding students' religious tolerance and the resulting benefits (Khaerun Rijaal, 2021; Quinlan et al., 2022). Testing students' religious tolerance is essential to evaluate the extent of their understanding of religious tolerance. By testing, we can find out whether students have an open attitude towards religious differences, whether they can appreciate and respect other people's religions, and whether they have a good understanding of human rights related to religious freedom. In testing students' religious tolerance, various methods can be used such as questionnaires, observation, or group discussions (Prasetyo, 2013; Tolerance et al., n.d.). The test results can provide an overview of the student's level of religious tolerance and become the basis for the next steps in improving their understanding.

In addition, understanding and testing religious tolerance also helps students to develop effective communication skills. In the process of understanding and testing religious tolerance, students will learn to listen with empathy and respect the views of others. They will learn to communicate well, respect differences of opinion, and maintain a constructive dialog (Wahyuni et al., 2021; Zamroni et al., 2020). These communication skills are very important in building good relationships with fellow humans, especially in a context full of differences in religion and belief. In a study conducted by Coffelt & Smith (2020) on high school students in Indonesia, it was found that students who understood and tested religious tolerance had a more inclusive attitude and were better able to communicate well in the context of religion and belief. They are also better able to build harmonious relationships with fellow students of different religions and beliefs.

Testing and understanding students' religious tolerance has significant benefits. First, it can help create an inclusive and harmonious school environment where students feel safe and comfortable practicing their religion. Secondly, it can also help prevent interfaith conflicts or disagreements, as students can understand and respect religious differences. Thirdly, it can help build a more tolerant generation that can coexist peacefully in a religiously diverse society. Finally, it can also help shape students' personalities who are more thoughtful, empathetic, and able to think critically in addressing religious differences. In addition to testing, it is also important for students to understand about religious tolerance. Understanding religious tolerance involves understanding the basic values of religion, such as mutual respect, understanding, and appreciation. Students need to understand that religion is an important part of individual identity and have the right to practice their own beliefs (Aswidar & Saragih, 2022; Sari et al., 2014; Sufanti et al., 2014b; Thaufan & Sapriya, 2018). Understanding religious tolerance also means understanding the importance of avoiding discrimination and intolerance based on religion. In the process of understanding religious tolerance, students need to be invited to dialogue and interact with friends from different religions to broaden their horizons and understanding of other religions.

5. Conclusion

This scale validation is used to test the instrument in helping to understand the ability of students' tolerance attitudes. Understanding students' religious tolerance is essential in building a tolerant and harmonious generation. By testing, we can evaluate students' level of religious tolerance, while by understanding, students can gain a deeper understanding of the importance of religious tolerance. Thus, schools and educators must give sufficient attention to testing and understanding students' religious tolerance to create a peaceful and harmonious religious society. Understanding and testing religious tolerance is essential for students facing an increasingly pluralistic world. It helps them develop mutual respect and appreciation of differences, effective communication skills, and

inclusive and cooperative attitudes. Therefore, education that promotes understanding and testing religious tolerance should be a priority in our education system. By doing so, we can build a harmonious, inclusive, and respectful society of different religions and beliefs.

Acknowledgment

Reference

1. Alhadiq, M. F., & Ramadhan, G. M. (2021). Persepsi Guru Terhadap Toleransi Siswa SD. *Jurnal Mutiara Pedagogik*, *6*(1), 2021. https://aulad.org/index.php/aulad/article/view/183

2. Anas, Mubarok, S., Wicaksana, N., & Rachmadi, M. (2019). Genetic gain of Al tolerance and contribution of agronomic traits on Al tolerance in the early stage of sorghum breeding program. *Plant Production Science*, *22*(2), 319–326. https://doi.org/10.1080/1343943X.2019.1569471

3. Aswidar, R., & Saragih, S. Z. (2022). Karakter Religius, Toleransi, dan Disiplin pada Siswa Sekolah Menengah Pertama. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, *6*(1), 134–142. https://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/JIPP/article/view/43373

4. Azis, A., Haikal, Mu., & Iswanto, S. (2018). Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Budaya Toleransi dalam Pembelajaran Sejarah (Studi Kasus SMA Negeri 1 Banda Aceh). *BRILIANT: Jurnal Riset Dan Konseptual*, *3*(3), 287–299. https://doi.org/10.28926/briliant

5. Basharpoor, S., Mowlaie, M., & Sarafrazi, L. (2021). The Relationships of Distress Tolerance, Self-compassion to Posttraumatic Growth, the Mediating Role of Cognitive Fusion. *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment and Trauma*, *30*(1), 70–81. https://doi.org/10.1080/10926771.2019.1711279

6. Coffelt, T. A., & Smith, F. L. M. (2020). Exemplary and Unacceptable Workplace Communication Skills. *Business and Professional Communication Quarterly*, *83*(4), 365–384. https://doi.org/10.1177/2329490620946425

7. Conway, C. C., Naragon-Gainey, K., & Harris, M. T. (2021). The Structure of Distress Tolerance and Neighboring Emotion Regulation Abilities. *Assessment*, *28*(4), 1050–1064. https://doi.org/10.1177/1073191120954914

8. Cresswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.

9. Garneau, C. R. H., & Schwadel, P. (2022). Examining the Influence of Political Affiliation and Orientation on Political Tolerance. *Socius*, *8*. https://doi.org/10.1177/23780231221132368

10. Gellera, G. (2020). Christian tolerance and tolerance of the Christians: Natural law and conscience in James Dundas's Idea Philosophiae Moralis (1679). *Global Intellectual History*, *5*(2), 171–190. https://doi.org/10.1080/23801883.2019.1699886

11. Gursoy, D., Altinay, L., & Kenebayeva, A. (2017). Religiosity and entrepreneurship behaviours. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, *67*(June), 87–94. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2017.08.005

12. Hadiwinarto. (2014). Analisis Faktor Hasil Penilaian Budi Pekerti. *Jurnal Psikologi*, *41*(2), 229–240.

13. Hill QC, M. (2020). Historical Hinterlands for Religious Freedom in the United Kingdom. *Studies in Christian Ethics*, *33*(2), 147–155. https://doi.org/10.1177/0953946819896076

14. Janmaat, J. G., & Keating, A. (2019). Are today's youth more tolerant? Trends in tolerance among young people in Britain. *Ethnicities*, *19*(1), 44–65. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796817723682

15. Justwan, F., & Fisher, S. K. (2021). Territorial claims, territorial attachment, and political tolerance: evidence from India. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, *9*(1), 190–207. https://doi.org/10.1080/21565503.2018.1528164

16. Kang, H., Li, Z. M., Liu, T., Yuan, W., & Wu, Y. (2022). A novel method to design tolerance of aero-engine casing by integrating 3-D assembly tolerance with performance instability. *Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Part B: Journal of Engineering Manufacture*, *236*(8), 1052–1070. https://doi.org/10.1177/09544054211060917

17. Kartadinata, S. (2011). *Menguak Tabir Bimbingan dan Konseling sebagai Upaya Pedagogis Kiat Mendidik sebagai Landasan Profesional Tindakan Konselor*. UPI Press. http://library1.nida.ac.th/termpaper6/sd/2554/19755.pdf

18. Kartini, R. O., Indrawadi, J., Program, F., Pancasila, S. P., & Kewarganegaraan, D. (2019). TOLERANSI DALAM KEBERAGAMAN DI SEKOLAH MAYORITAS BUDHA (Studi di SD Manjushri Padang). *Jce.Ppj.Unp.Ac.Id*, *2*(1). http://jce.ppj.unp.ac.id/index.php/jce/article/view/100

19. Khaerun Rijaal, M. A. (2021). Fenomena Intoleransi Antar Umat Beragama Serta Peran Sosial Media Akun Instagram Jaringan Gusdurian Indonesia Dalam Menyampaikan Pesan Toleransi. *Syiar | Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam*, *1*(2), 103–132. https://doi.org/10.54150/SYIAR.V1I2.41

20. Laborie, L. (2017). Radical tolerance in early enlightenment Europe. *History of European Ideas*, *43*(4), 359–375. https://doi.org/10.1080/01916599.2016.1203600

21. Lacoe, J., & Steinberg, M. P. (2018). Rolling Back Zero Tolerance: The Effect of Discipline Policy Reform on Suspension Usage and Student Outcomes. *Peabody Journal of Education*, *93*(2), 207–227. https://doi.org/10.1080/0161956X.2018.1435047

22. Mao, M., Zhang, L., Ge, J., Yan, J., Northington, R., Yao, M., Nowacki, J., & Hays, N. P. (2018). Infant Feeding Regimens and Gastrointestinal Tolerance: A Multicenter, Prospective, Observational Cohort Study in China. *Global Pediatric Health*, *5*. https://doi.org/10.1177/2333794X17750271

23. Marium, A., Kausar, A., Ali Shah, S. M., Ashraf, M. Y., Akhtar, N., Akram, M., & Riaz, M. (2019). Assessment of Cucumber Genotypes for Salt Tolerance Based on Germination and Physiological Indices. *Dose-Response*, *17*(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/1559325819889809

24. Maurer, C., & Gellera, G. (2020). Contexts of religious tolerance: New perspectives from early modern Britain and beyond. *Global Intellectual History*, *5*(2), 125–136. https://doi.org/10.1080/23801883.2019.1699869

25. Mokoena, K., Dickason-Koekemoer, Z., & Ferreira-Schenk, S. (2021). Analysing the risk tolerance levels of stokvel investors. *Cogent Social Sciences*, *7*(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.1943890

26. Ni, O., Ayu, N., Institut, S., Dharma, H., & Denpasar, N. (n.d.). Penanaman Toleransi Dalam Pembelajaran Akidah Akhlak Di Madrasah Aliyah Swasta Tazakka. *Repository.Iaincurup.Ac.Id*. Retrieved August 15, 2023, from http://repository.iaincurup.ac.id/1404/1/5678-22049-1-PB.pdf

27. Novis-Deutsch, N. (2020). "God's Operating Manual": Marriage Theologies in Ultra-Orthodox and Evangelical Marital Guidebooks. *Journal of Family History*, *45*(2), 191–206. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363199019859912

28. Novitasari, L., & Wardani, N. S. (2020). Pengembangan Instrumen Sikap Toleransi Dalam Pembelajaran Tematik Kelas 5 SD. *PeTeKa (Jurnal Penelitian Tindakan Kelas Dan Pengembangan Pembelajaran)*, *3*(1), 41–52. https://doi.org/10.31604/ptk.v3i1.41-52

29. Nurul, K., Uin, I., & Makassar, A. (n.d.). Moderasi Beragama di Tengah Pluralitas Bangsa: Tinjauan Revolusi Mental Perspektif Al-Qur'an. *KURIOSITAS: Media Komunikasi Sosial Dan Keagamaan Volume*. Retrieved June 20, 2023, from http://ejurnal.iainpare.ac.id/index.php/kuriositas/article/download/1379/710

30. Prasetyo, A. (2013). Pluralitas Agama Dalam Keluarga Jawa. *KOMUNITAS: International Journal of Indonesian Society and Culture*, *5*(1), 64–73. https://doi.org/10.15294/komunitas.v5i1.2374

31. Purwaningsih, E. (2015). Mengembangkan sikap toleransi dan kebersamaan di kalangan siswa. *Jurnal Visi Ilmu Pendidikan*, *7*(2), 1699–1715. https://jurnal.untan.ac.id/index.php/jvip/article/view/17156

32. Quinlan, E., Deane, F. P., Schilder, S., & Read, E. (2022). Confidence in case formulation and pluralism as predictors of psychologists' tolerance of uncertainty: Formulation, pluralism, uncertainty tolerance. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, *35*(4), 943–958. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515070.2021.1997918

33. Sakallı, Ö., Tlili, A., Altınay, F., Karaatmaca, C., Altınay, Z., & Dağlı, G. (2021). The Role of Tolerance Education in Diversity Management: A Cultural Historical Activity Theory Perspective. *SAGE Open*, *11*(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211060831

34. Santoso, J., Bakti Sarono, T., Sutrisno, S., & Kurnia Putrawan, B. (2022). Moderasi Beragama di Indonesia: Kajian Tentang Toleransi dan Pluralitas di Indonesia. *Jurnal Teologi Berita Hidup*, *4*(2), 324. https://e-journal.sttberitahidup.ac.id/index.php/jbh/article/view/167

35. Santoso, Kiswantoro, A., & Zamroni, E. (2015). Konselor Altruis: Life Model dalam Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Karakter Peduli Sosial, Tanggung Jawab dan Bersahabat pada Siswa. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Bimbingan Dan Konsleing PD ABKIN Jawa Timur*, 171–186.

36. Sari, Y. M., Pkn, P., & Upi, S. (2014). Pembinaan toleransi dan peduli sosial dalam upaya memantapkan watak kewarganegaraan (civic disposition) siswa. *Ejournal.Upi.Edu*, *23*(1), 15. https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/jpis/article/view/2059

37. Setiadi, R., Kartadinata, S., & Nakaya, A. (2017). A peace pedagogy model for the development of peace culture in an education setting. *The Open Psychology Journal*, *10*(1), 182–189. https://doi.org/10.2174/1874350101710010182

38. Shen, X., Zhang, P., Wang, J., An, Y., Gregg, E. W., Zhang, B., Li, H., Gong, Q., Chen, Y., Shuai, Y., Engelgau, M. M., Hu, Y., Bennett, P. H., & Li, G. (2018). Influence of improvement or worsening of glucose tolerance on risk of stroke in persons with impaired glucose tolerance. *International Journal of Stroke*, *13*(9), 941–948. https://doi.org/10.1177/1747493018784432

39. Sholeh, A. (2014). Mengembangkan sikap toleransi dan kebersamaan di kalangan siswa. *J-PAI*, *1*(1). https://scholar.archive.org/work/df4uznkt6fa7td6zhycobtm4ze/access/wayback/http://jurnal.untan.ac.id/index.php/jvip/article/viewFile/48/46

40. Simon, B., Eschert, S., Schaefer, C. D., Reininger, K. M., Zitzmann, S., & Smith, H. J. (2019). Disapproved, but Tolerated: The Role of Respect in Outgroup Tolerance. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, *45*(3), 406–415. https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167218787810

41. Staničić, A., & Šijaković, M. (2019). (Re)building Spaces of Tolerance: A "Symbiotic Model" for the Post-War City Regeneration. *Architecture and Culture*, *7*(1), 113–128. https://doi.org/10.1080/20507828.2018.1556374

42. Suciartini, N. N. A. (2017). Urgensi pendidikan toleransi dalam wajah pembelajaran sebagai upaya meningkatkan kualitas pendidikan. *Jurnal Penjaminan Mutu*. https://ejournal.ihdn.ac.id/index.php/JPM/article/view/88

43. Sufanti, M., Sofyan, A., Sabardila, A., Fitri, D., & Rahmawati, P. (2014a). Peranan pendidikan kewarganegaraan dalam membina sikap toleransi antar siswa. *Journal.Unpak.Ac.Id*, *15*(1), 78–88. https://journal.unpak.ac.id/index.php/JPPGuseda/article/view/3610

44. Sufanti, M., Sofyan, A., Sabardila, A., Fitri, D., & Rahmawati, P. (2014b). Variasi Persepsi Siswa terhadap Makna Hakiki dan makna Kontekstual Kata Toleransi dalam Kehidupan Beragama. *Journals.Ums.Ac.Id*, *15*(1), 78–88. https://journals.ums.ac.id/index.php/humaniora/article/view/782

45. Sugiyono. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. PT Alfabeta.

46. Tan, E. K. B. (2007). Norming "moderation" in an "iconic target": Public policy and the regulation of religious anxieties in Singapore. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, *19*(4), 443–462. https://doi.org/10.1080/09546550701590610

47. Thaufan, & Sapriya. (2018). Pelembagaan karakter toleransi siswa melalui program pendidikan berkarakter Purwakarta. *Citizenship Jurnal Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan Avaliable*, *6*(1), 17–29. http://e-journal.unipma.ac.id/index.php/citizenship/article/view/1845

48. Toleransi, S., Siswa, B., Aliyah, M., Kabupaten, D., Tengah, K. J., Atmanto, N. E., & Muzayanah, D. U. (n.d.). Sikap Toleransi Beragama Siswa Madrasah Aliyah di Kabupaten Kendal Jawa Tengah. *Journal.Blasemarang.Id*. https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v6i2.1113

49. Utaminingsih, S., Utomo, S., & Zamroni, E. (2017). Strengthening of Indonesian Islamic Character Though Islamic Education Management Based of Soft Skills. *Addin*, *11*(1), 215. https://doi.org/10.21043/addin.v11i1.2033

50. Wahyuni, S, Ilmu, S. Y.-J. J. I., & 2021, undefined. (2021). Group Investigation sebagai Proses Penanaman Sikap Toleransi Siswa Kelas IX dalam Pembelajaran IPS. *Repository.Iainponorogo.Ac.Id*, *1*, 141–150. http://repository.iainponorogo.ac.id/1258/

51. Wahyuni, Sri, & Yusuf, S. M. (2020). Penanaman Sikap Toleransi Dalam Berelasi Siswa Melalui Budaya 5S di MA Muhammadiyah 1 Ponorogo. *JIPSI: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial Indonesia Nomor*, *1*, 141–150. http://etheses.iainponorogo.ac.id/id/eprint/11095

52. Wan Husin, W. N., Halim, N. A., & Zul Kernain, N. F. (2021). Students' perceptions on ethnic tolerance in Malaysia: A study in three public universities. *Ethnicities*, *21*(1), 98–119. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796820951991

53. Wibisono, M. Y., Truna, D. S., & Haq, M. Z. (2020). *Modul Sosialisasi Toleransi Beragama*. Prodi S2 Studi Agama-Agama. http://digilib.uinsgd.ac.id/35325/

54. Zakiyah, A. A. (2022). Hadis-Hadis tentang Toleransi Beragama dalam Pemahaman dan Pengamalan Siswa SMK Texar Karawang. *Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Ushuluddin*, *2*(3), 615–629. https://doi.org/10.15575/jpiu.v2i3.15496

55. Zamroni, E. (2022). *Kajian hermeneutika nilai-nilai Suluk Linglung Sunan Kalijaga sebagai salah satu landasan Filosofis konseling Indonesia* [Repositori Universitas Negeri Malang]. http://repository.um.ac.id/271785/

56. Zamroni, E., Hanurawan, F., Hambali, I. M., Hidayah, N., & Triyono. (2020). Existential Counseling Framework From A Spiritual Perspective : A Meta-Analysis. *Journal of Critical Reviews ISSN-*, *7*(9), 520–524. https://doi.org/10.31838/jcr.07.09.103